THE UNIVERSITY OF CHICAGO

LATE CRETACEOUS TO PLEISTOCENE CLIMATES: NATURE OF THE TRANSITION FROM A 'HOT-HOUSE' TO AN 'ICE-HOUSE' WORLD

VOLUME ONE

A DISSERTATION SUBMITTED TO
THE FACULTY OF THE DIVISION OF THE PHYSICAL SCIENCES
IN CANDIDACY FOR THE DEGREE OF
DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY

DEPARTMENT OF THE GEOPHYSICAL SCIENCES

BY
PAUL J. MARKWICK

CHICAGO, ILLINOIS
JUNE, 1996

Copyright © 1996 by Paul J. Markwick

All rights reserved

TABLE OF CONTENTS

VOLUME ONE

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS iii

LIST OF TABLES xv

LIST OF FIGURES xvi

CHAPTER I.
INTRODUCTION 1

I.1. INTRODUCTION 1

I.2. THIS STUDY 8

I.3. SUMMARY 13

CHAPTER II.
THE GEOLOGICAL EVIDENCE FOR TRIASSIC TO PLEISTOCENE GLACIATIONS: IMPLICATIONS FOR EUSTACY 15

II.1. INTRODUCTION 16

II.2. WHAT IS A GLACIAL INTERVAL? 20

  II.2.1. Essentials for Creating a Glacier 22

II.3. PUTATIVE EVIDENCE FOR MESOZOIC AND EARLY CENOZOIC GLACIATIONS 26

  II.3.1.Rhythmites, Cyclicity, and Eustatic Sea-Level Change 27

  II.3.2. Pebbly Mudstones and Erratics. 30

  II.3.3. The Erratics of the Chalk and Upper Greensand of Southern England 44

    II.3.3.1. Depositional Environment and Provenance 47

  II.3.4. The Erratics of South Australia 49

    II.3.4.1. Depositional Environment and Provenence 53

II.3.5. Erratic Emplacement Mechanisms. 55
II.3.5.1. Non-rafting Mechanisms 55
II.3.5.1.1. Impact 55
II.3.5.1.2. Mass flow 55
II.3.5.2. Rafting Mechanisms 57
II.3.5.2.1. Ice 57
II.3.5.2.1.1. Coastal, sea and river ice.-- 57
II.3.5.2.1.2. Icebergs.-- 60
II.3.5.2.2. Animals 62
II.3.5.2.3. Seaweed 65
II.3.5.2.4. Trees 66
II.3.6. Geochemical Evidence. Oxygen Isotopes as an Indicator of Sequestered Water Volumes. 70
II.3.7. Mineralogical Evidence. Glendonites 77
II.4. THE PRESERVATION OF TERRESTRIAL GLACIATIONS 79
II.5. THE ORIGIN OF MESOZOIC - EARLY CENOZOIC ERRATICS: A DISCUSSION 80
II.5.1. The Causes of Glaciation 86
II.6. CONCLUSIONS 87

CHAPTER III.
THE VERTEBRATE DATABASE, V.3.5 89

III.1. INTRODUCTION 89
III.1.1. A Successful Database must be "Simple Enough that it can be used, but Comprehensive Enough that it will be Useful." 90
III.2. THE DATABASE 94
III.2.1. Basic Structure 94

III.2.2. Data Sources 99

III.2.3. Principal Relations 100

III.2.3.1. Main References 100

III.2.3.2. Main Taxonomy 102

III.2.3.3. Main Localities 104

III.2.3.4. Main Climate Stations 109

III.2.3.5. Main Taxa by Locality 111

III.2.3.6. Main Taxa by Climate Stations 114

III.2.4. Subsidiary Relations 115

III.2.4.1. Standard Taxonomy 115

III.2.4.2. Timescale 116

III.2.4.3. Timescale II 118

III.2.4.4. Geography 120

III.2.4.5. Plate ID's 121

III.2.4.6. Journal Lookup 122

III.2.4.7. Reconstructions 122

III.2.4.8. Minor Synonymies 123

III.2.3. Aims of the Database, Future Versions and Potential Users 124

CHAPTER IV.
FOSSIL CROCODILIANS AS INDICATORS OF LATE CRETACEOUS AND CENOZOIC CLIMATES: IMPLICATIONS FOR USING PALAEONTOLOGICAL DATA FOR GLOBAL CHANGE: PART 1--THE PRESENT 127

IV.1. INTRODUCTION 127

IV.1.1. The Study Group, Order Crocodylia 128

IV.2. EMPIRICAL BIOLOGICAL OBSERVATIONS 132

IV.2.1. Basic physiology 132
IV.2.2. Terminology 133
IV.2.3. Environment Verses Body Temperatures 134
IV.2.4. Crocodilian Thermal Limits 135
IV.2.5. Importance of Size 138
IV.2.6. The Consequences of Extreme Temperatures 140
    IV.2.6.1. Effect on Feeding 141
    IV.2.6.2. Effect on Juvenile Survival 142
IV.2.7. Thermoregulation 144
    IV.2.7.1. Behavioural Thermoregulation 145
    IV.2.7.2. Physiological Thermoregulation 147
IV.2.8. Hibernation and Aestivation 149
IV.2.9. Non-Thermal Climatic Constraints 151
IV.3. CLIMATE INFERRED FROM BIOGEOGRAPHY 153
IV.3.1. Historical Artifact - the Effect of Humans 154
IV.3.2. Ecological Limitations 155
IV.3.3. The climate of Living Crocodilians 155
    IV.3.3.1. The Dataset 155
    IV.3.3.2. Results 159
IV.4. DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSIONS 194

VOLUME TWO

CHAPTER V.
FOSSIL CROCODILIANS AS INDICATORS OF LATE CRETACEOUS AND CENOZOIC CLIMATES: IMPLICATIONS FOR USING

PALAEONTOLOGICAL DATA FOR GLOBAL CHANGE: PART 2--THE PAST 199

- V.1. INTRODUCTION 199
- V.2. CLASSIFICATION 200
- V.3. BIASES 201
  - V.3.1. Resolution 202
    - V.3.1.1. Spatial Resolution 202
    - V.3.1.2. Temporal Resolution and Time Averaging 203
  - V.3.2. Representation 206
    - V.3.2.1. Reporting 212
    - V.3.2.2. Collection 214
    - V.3.2.3. Tectonics 214
    - V.3.2.4. Taphonomy 216
      - V.3.2.4.1. Taphonomic control groups 219
    - V.3.2.5. History. Paleobiogeography 224
  - V.3.3. Errors 227
    - V.3.3.1. Misidentification 227
    - V.3.3.2. Dating 229
- V.4. TRENDS 231
- V.5. LATITUDINAL GRADIENTS 240
- V.6. MAPS 246
  - V.6.1. Cretaceous 247
  - V.6.2. Tertiary 259
  - V.6.3. Quaternary 280
- V.7. CONCLUSIONS 280

CHAPTER VI.
'EQUABILITY', CONTINENTALITY AND TERTIARY 'CLIMATE': THE CROCODILIAN PERSPECTIVE 283

VI.1. INTRODUCTION 284

VI.2. CROCODILIANS AS CLIMATE PROXIES 285

VI.3. PRESENT DAY CROCODILIANS 286

VI.4. FOSSIL CROCODILIAN DISTRIBUTIONS AND INFERRED PALEOCLIMATE 290

  VI.4.1. Eocene 291

  VI.4.2. Late Oligocene 292

  VI.4.3. Miocene 294

  VI.4.4. Pleistocene-Holocene 295

VI.5. CONCLUSIONS 295

CHAPTER VII.
CROCODILIAN DIVERSITY: THE INFLUENCE OF CLIMATE 297

VII.1. INTRODUCTION 297

VII.2. THE DATASET 299

VII.3. DIVERSITY PATTERNS 300

  VII.3.1. Global Generic Diversity Patterns 300

    VII.3.1.1. Interpreting Diversity Patterns 305

      VII.3.1.1.1. The effect of sampling on diversity 305

      VII.3.1.1.2. Extrinsic causes 316

      VII.3.1.1.3. Intrinsic or Extrinsic? 317

      VII.3.1.1.4. Diversification models 318

  VII.3.2. Spatial Variations in Diversity 327

    VII.3.2.1. Diversity by Paleolatitude 329

VII.3.2.2. Diversity by Continent 352

VII.3.3. Extinction and the K-T Boundary 359

VII.4. CONCLUSIONS 365

CHAPTER VIII.
"THE FUTURE FORETOLD, THE PAST EXPLAINED, THE PRESENT...APOLOGIZED FOR": GENERAL CONCLUSIONS AND FUTURE WORK 371

VIII.1. CONCLUSIONS: THE PRESENT 372

VIII.2. CONCLUSIONS:THE PAST 373

VIII.2.1. Mesozoic Glaciations? 373

VIII.2.2. Crocodilian Distributions 375

VIII.2.3. Crocodilian Diversity 377

VIII.3. THE FUTURE 378

VIII.4. FINAL THOUGHTS 386

REFERENCES 391

VOLUME THREE

APPENDIX A.
LOCALITIES BY TIME INTERVAL 435

VOLUME FOUR

(APPENDIX A continued) 667

APPENDIX B.

CROCODILIAN OCCURRENCES 863

APPENDIX C.
GENUS AGE RANGES 907

VOLUME FIVE

APPENDIX D.
THE VERTEBRATE DATABASE, v.3.5 913

LIST OF TABLES

II.1. Mechanisms controlling short and long term eustatic sea level 18

II.2. Indicators of glaciation 28

II.3. Summary of pre-Pleistocene erratic-bearing deposits 32

II.4. Rafting mechanisms 63

IV.1. Zoo environmental temperatures 139

IV.2. Principal components analysis, unrotated loadings 174

IV.3. Correlation matrix for a selection of thermal and precipitation parameters. 178

IV.4. Partial correlation matrix for a selection of thermal and precipitation parameters 180

V.1. Resampling results 235

VI.1. Climate data for areas and locations referred to in the text 287

VIII.1. Data summary 304

LIST OF FIGURES

II.1. The relationship between changes in global sea-level (dSL), volume of water sequestered and ice area required 19

II.2. The area of ice implied by the 3rd-order eustatic sea-level curve of Haq et al. (1987). After Rowley and Markwick (1992) 20

II.3. The area of ice required to account for the Upper Turonian sea-level fall of Haq et al. (1987) 21

II.4. Distribution of glaciation in the geologic record as implied by the frequency of glacial diamictite occurrences 22

II.5. The elevation of glacier termini versus latitude 23

II.6. The ice-free, isostatically corrected, topography of Antarctica (after Drewry, 1983) 25

II.7. The distribution of glacial diamictite occurrences through time on which is superimposed the area of deformation as derived by Richter et al. (1992) 26

II.8. Distribution of middle Cretaceous erratics in north-west Europe. 45

II.9. Distribution of Australian middle Cretaceous erratics 51

II.10. The relationship of ice thickness to its effective growing period 58

II.11. The carrying capacities of ice bodies of different thicknesses (cm) and areas (m). 59

II.12. Graph showing the tree size required to carry boulders of specified size 68

II.13. The benthonic and planktonic oxygen isotope curves (after Prentice and Matthews, 1988) 71

II.14. The oxygen isotope curve for the Plenus Marl of southern England (after Lamolda et al., 1994) with the sea-level change and volume of sequestered water implied by these values 75

II.15. A reconstruction of the possible scenario for formation of erratic bearing beds in South Australia during the middle Cretaceous 85

III.1 Basic database structure 96

III.2 Screen picture of typical listings 97

III.3 Screen picture of typical subform listings 98

III.4. Screen picture of principal entry form in the "Main References" relation. 101

III.5 Screen picture of principal entry form in the "Main Taxonomy" relation 103

III.6 Screen picture of principal entry form in the "Main Locality" relation 105

III.7 Screen picture of principal entry form in the "Climate Station" relation 110

III.8 Screen picture of principal entry form in the "Main Taxa by Locality" relation 112

III.9 Screen picture of principal entry form in the "Taxa by Climate Station" relation 114

III.10 Screen picture of principal entry form in the "Standard Taxonomy" relation 116

III.11 Screen picture of principal entry form in the "Timescale" relation 117

III.12 Screen picture of principal entry form in the "Timescale II" relation 118

III.13 Screen picture of principal entry form in the "Geography" relation 119

III.14 Screen picture of principal entry form in the "Plate ID's" relation 120

III.15 Screen picture of principal entry form in the "Journal Lookup" relation 121

III.16 Screen picture of principal entry form in the "Reconstructions" relation 123

III.17 Screen picture of principal entry form in the "Minor Synonymies" relation 124

IV.1. The distribution of modern climate stations used in this study 129

IV.2. The critical, activity and selected temperature ranges for five crocodilians 137

IV.3. The relationship of fossil localities and modern climate stations with latitude. 156

IV.4. Graphs showing the frequency distribution of stations for specified climate parameters 160

IV.5. A graph of component 1 and component 2 scores from a Principal Component Analysis (PCA) of 16 climate parameters. 175

IV.6. The relationship between mean annual temperature (MAT) and precipitation with latitude. 177

IV.7. Monthly mean temperature distributions for selected climate stations. 181

IV.8. The distribution of crocodilians in MAT-MART climate space. 183

IV.9. The percentage of all stations in each 5° latitudinal band that have crocodilians assigned to them. 184

IV.10. The percentage of all stations that contain crocodilians, as a function of MAT. 185

IV.11. The global distribution of stations with MAT≥14.2°C. 186

IV.12. The global distribution of stations with MART≤24.0°C. 187

IV.13. The global distribution of stations with CMM≥5.5°C. 188

IV.14. The global distribution of all stations with specified minimum thermal limits compared with the observed distribution of extant crocodilians. 189

IV.15. The global distribution of stations with annual P≥8mm. 191

IV.16. The global distribution of stations with calculated sea-level values of MAT≥14.2°C and ≥16.0°C. 192

V.1. Box plot of all vertebrate localities in the database. 205

V.2. Pie charts showing the proportion of localities in each continent (A) and normalized for area (B). 206

V.3. Number and rate of localities by interval. 208

V.4. Interval length versus number of vertebrate localities. 210

V.5. Proportion of localities represented by crocodilians (top) and turtles (bottom). 211

V.6. Pie chart showing proportion of vertebrate localities represented by each basin type. 213

V.7. Pie charts showing the distribution of environments in the fossil dataset. 215

V.8. Pie chart showing distribution of crown group crocodilian specimens recorded in the database. 216

V.9. The distribution of climate stations with turtles in MAT-MART climate space. 218

V.10. Turtle bearing stations as a function of latitude. 219

V.11. Turtle bearing stations as the proportion of all localities in each 5° latitudinal zone. 221

V.12. The proportion of turtle stations with crocodilians for each 5° latitudinal band. 222

V.13. The ratio of crown group crocodilian localities to turtle localities for each interval. 223

V.14. Maps showing distribution of alligatorids, crocodylids and gavialids. 224

V.15. Distribution of crown group crocodilian localities which have complete skulls preserved. 226

V.16. The paleolatitudinal distribution of crocodilian and non-crocodilian vertebrate localities. 230

V.17. Paleolatitudinal distribution of crown group crocodilians in the Northern Hemisphere. 231

V.18. The ratio of the maximum paleolatitudes represented by crown group crocodilians and turtles through time. 232

V.19. Resampled crown group crocodilian paleolatitudinal distributions. 234

V.20. Interval length versus maximum crown group paleolatitude. 236

V.21. Paleolatitudinal distribution of each crown group family through time. 237

V.22. The relationship between the ratio of crocodilian to turtle localities and MAT (°C) for each 5° latitudinal zone. 239

V.23. Thermal gradients determined using the ratio of crocodilian to turtle localities. 241

V.24. Aptian map (116 Ma). 246

V.25. Albian map (105 Ma). 248

V.26. Cenomanian (92 Ma). 249

V.27. Turonian (90 Ma). 250

V.28. Senonian (70 Ma). 251

V.29. Coniacian map (88 Ma). 252

V.30. Santonian map (85 Ma). 253

V.31. Campanian map (78 Ma). 255
V.32. Maastrichtian map (70 Ma). 256
V.33. Paleocene map (59 Ma). 258
V.34. Early Paleocene (Danian) map (63 Ma). 259
V.35. Late Paleocene (Thanetian) map (59 Ma). 260
V.36. Eocene map (46 Ma). 263
V.37. Early Eocene map (55 Ma). 264
V.38. Middle Eocene map (46 Ma). 265
V.39. Late Eocene map (38 Ma). 266
V.40. Oligocene map (26 Ma). 268
V.41. Early Oligocene map (33 Ma). 269
V.42. Late Oligocene map (26 Ma). 270
V.43. Miocene map (10 Ma). 272
V.44. Early Miocene map (20 Ma). 273
V.45. Middle Miocene map (10 Ma). 274
V.46. Late Miocene map (8 Ma). 275
V.47. Pliocene map (3 ma). 276
V.48. Pleistocene map (0 Ma). 277
VI.1. Distribution of vertebrate and crocodilian localities during Eocene 288
VI.2. Distribution of vertebrates and crocodilians in Late Oligocene 290
VI.3. Distribution of vertebrates and crocodilians in Miocene 291
VI.4. Distribution of vertebrates and crocodilians in Pleistocene and early Holocene 292
VII.1. The generic diversity of all crocodilians. 299
VII.2. The generic diversity of crown group crocodilians. 300

VII.3. A. Crown group per-genus rates of origination (r_s) and extinction (r_e). Per-genus rates of diversification through time ($r_s - r_e$). 301

VII.4. The relation between the number of species and number of genera in each time interval 302

VII.5. The relation between crown group crocodilian generic diversity and the number of localities at which they are recorded. 306

VII.6. The relation between crown group crocodilian diversity and the total number of vertebrate localities in each interval. 307

VII.7. The relation between the number of localities at which crown group crocodilians are recorded and the interval length. 308

VII.8. The relationship between crown group crocodilian diversity and the interval length (in millions of years). 308

VII.9. Crown group crocodilian generic diversity using only those genera that occur in more than one locality. 309

VII.10. Crown group crocodilian generic diversity using only genera that occur at least five localities. 310

VII.11. Crown group crocodilian generic diversity, GP≤3, ≤2 time intervals. 311

VII.12. Crown group crocodilian diversity based on absolute counts per interval 312

VII.13. The completeness of the record based on the ratio of observed diversity and calculated diversity; "gap analysis," sensu Paul (1985) 313

VII.14. Log crown group crocodilian generic diversity. 317

VII.15. Log alligatorid generic diversity. 318

VII.16. Log crocodylid generic diversity. 319

VII.17. Log gavialid generic diversity. 320

VII.18. Modeled diversification trends for crown group crocodilians using exponential and logistic models. 321

VII.19. Crocodilian species diversity. 322

VII.20. Log crown group crocodilian species diversity. 323

VII.21. Log "mesosuchian" generic diversity. 324

VII.22. The modern day distribution of crocodilian specific and generic diversity 326

VII.23. The paleolatitudinal distribution of all crocodilian localities as a function of time. Unsmoothed (top), smoothed (bottom). 328

VII.24. The paleolatitudinal distribution of all alligatorid genera through time............ 330

VII.25. The paleolatitudinal distribution of all crocodylid genera through time........... 331

VII.26. The paleolatitudinal distribution of all gavialid genera through time. 332

VII.27. The paleolatitudinal distribution of all crown group genera through time......... 333

VII.28. The paleolatitudinal distribution of all non-crown group "eusuchian" genera through time. 334

VII.29. The paleolatitudinal distribution of all "eusuchian" genera through time.......... 335

VII.30. The paleolatitudinal distribution of "mesosuchian" genera through time. 336

VII.31. The paleolatitudinal distribution of all crocodilian genera through time. 337

VII.32. The percentage of diversity represented by crown group crocodilians (top) and "mesosuchians" (bottom) as a function of paleolatitude and time. 339

VII.33. The paleolatitudinal distribution of generic first appearances (FA's) for all crocodilians as a function of time. 340

VII.34. The paleolatitudinal distribution of generic first appearances (FA's) for all crown group crocodilians as a function of time. 341

VII.35. The paleolatitudinal distribution of generic first appearances (FA's) for all "mesosuchians" as a function of time. 342

VII.36. The paleolatitudinal distribution of generic last appearances (LA's) for all crocodilians as a function of time. 343

VII.37. The paleolatitudinal distribution of generic first appearances (LA's) for all crown group crocodilians as a function of time. 344

VII.38. The paleolatitudinal distribution of generic first appearances (LA's) for all "mesosuchians" as a function of time. 345

VII.39. The direction of crocodilian diversity between consecutive intervals. 347

VII.40. The direction of crown group crocodilian diversity between consecutive intervals. 348

VII.41. The direction of "mesosuchian" diversity between consecutive intervals. 349

VII.42. African crocodilian generic diversity and percentage composition. 351

VII.43. Asian crocodilian generic diversity and percentage composition. 352

VII.44. Australian crocodilian generic diversity and percentage composition. 352

VII.45. European crocodilian generic diversity and percentage composition. 353

VII.46. "Indian" (includes Pakistan and Bangladesh) crocodilian generic diversity and percentage composition. 353

VII.47. North American crocodilian generic diversity and percentage composition. 354

VII.48. South American crocodilian generic diversity and percentage composition. 354

VII.49. Proportion of group represented by each continent 355

VII.50. Dinosaur and crown group crocodilian generic diversity. 358

VII.51. Percentage turnover of crown group crocodilian genera. 359

VII.52. The number of crown group crocodilian originations as a percentage of the surviving genera from the preceding interval. 361

VII.53. The paleolatitudinal distribution of dinosaurs and crocodilians. 362

VII.54. The per-genus rate of diversification for the "Mesosuchia." 364

VII.55. Percentage "mesosuchian" turnover. 365

VII.56. Crocodilian diversity as a function of gross ecology. 366

VIII.1. Recent North American reptilian generic diversity as a percentage of the non-avian tetrapod fauna. 377

VIII.2. The position of the giant tortoise *Geochelone* (top), and palms (bottom), in MAT-MART climate space. 379

VIII.3. Recent species diversity as a function of absolute latitude. 380

VIII.4. The relationship between non-avian tetrapod generic diversity and "productivity" (represented by NDVI). 381

VIII.5. A correspondence analysis of North American vertebrate faunas (genera). 382

VIII.6. A correspondence analysis of Australian amphibian faunas (species). 383

VIII.7. The paleolatitudinal distribution of the genus *Geochelone* (black circles), superimposed on that of the family Testudinidae (light gray circles).......... 385

VIII.8. The distribution of Recent peats (black circles) and evaporites (gray diamonds)... 386